

EUGENE CITY COUNCIL

AGENDA ITEM SUMMARY



Work Session: Triple Bottom Line Framework

Meeting Date: September 29, 2010
Department: Central Services, City Manager's Office
www.eugene-or.gov

Agenda Item Number: A
Staff Contact: Keli Osborn
Contact Telephone Number: 541-682-5406

ISSUE STATEMENT

This work session provides an opportunity to review the triple bottom line (TBL) framework and tools in use by City staff, and to discuss additional ways to incorporate social equity, environmental and economic considerations into council deliberations.

BACKGROUND

In the private sector, the concept of a triple bottom line means that a company is responsible not only to shareholders, but to stakeholders who are influenced by that company's actions. At the City of Eugene, applying a triple bottom line framework also can be a way of considering the impacts of decisions and actions. TBL analysis is intended to improve the quality of deliberations, decisions and services by expanding the discussion and highlighting social equity, environmental and economic issues that might not otherwise surface.

At the recommendation of the Sustainability Commission in 2008, City Manager Jon Ruiz directed staff to develop a triple bottom line analysis tool. Development of the tool involved a staff team and members of several advisory commissions. The commission sought to have the tool used in aiding policy-level discussions by the council.

In an April 2010 memo to council, staff shared a progress report and a link to multiple assessment tools. An interactive, online tool exists for staff use, but is not yet available to the public. As staff increasingly applies a triple bottom line framework in discussions and decision-making, some are creating specific tools to increase the ease of use and relevance to specific projects.

The triple bottom line framework has been applied in various ways – reviewing recommendations in the Walnut Station mixed-use project, evaluating potential FY11 budget reductions and fee increases for the Recreation Division, conducting a back-end examination of Neighborhood Matching Grants, evaluating Library customer receipts, and framing discussions of bike path and parks issues. The City Manager also conducted a general evaluation of FY10 budget proposals and their potential impacts for social equity, environmental health and economic prosperity.

Staff education has included presentations to department management teams and roundtable discussions with program managers. Additional staff training is planned this fall, along with an extended leadership focus in early 2011.

A mirror version of the online triple bottom line tool is in the final stages of development and will allow people who are working outside the City's network to use it to inform the development of plans, programs, ideas and policies. Access to this version will initially be offered to councilors, board and commission members, and others who are doing the City's work. This will allow staff to efficiently work out any bugs in the system, and to have a better idea of how much technical support resource might be required should we move to a model of broader access. More detailed information about how to access and use the tool will be provided when it goes "live."

The City's ongoing ability to use the online tool will be protected by reserving the City's copyright. The City may then license the use of the tool to certain individuals and organizations on terms that meet the City's current and long-term interests.

The triple bottom line concept considers multiple values and acknowledges that actions have social, environmental and economic impacts. TBL analysis is not an equation and does not result in a pat answer. It doesn't tell decision makers *what* to do. But, it can provide rich information and, sometimes, unexpected learning to better inform decisions. The triple bottom line framework incorporates several elements:

Social Equity

How might a proposal or action affect the ability to meet basic human needs? How could it influence cultural expression, community relationships, effective government, safety and personal security needs, and neighborhood and stakeholder commitment and stewardship? Are there potential inequities for specific groups of people, and how are those addressed? Have all voices been heard?

Environmental Health

How could a proposal or action affect environmental health and our ability to effectively address climate uncertainties? Does it prevent pollution? What are the possible impacts for air, soil and water? How might it affect how our community looks?

Economic Prosperity

How would an action or proposal affect the local economy and what are its costs to the community, now and over the long term? How does the proposal or action support responsible stewardship of public resources?

RELATED CITY POLICIES

In February 2000, the council adopted Resolution No. 4618, which outlines a definition and statement of intent regarding the application of sustainability principles to the City of Eugene, and affirms the commitment of City elected officials and staff to uphold these principles.

TBL analysis also aligns with the council's vision to:

- Value all people, encouraging respect and appreciation for diversity, equity, justice, and social well-being. We recognize and appreciate our differences and embrace our common humanity as the source of our strength;
- Be responsible stewards of our physical assets and natural resources. We will sustain our clean air and water, beautiful parks and open spaces, livable and safe neighborhoods, and foster a vibrant downtown, including a stable infrastructure; and
- Encourage a strong, sustainable and vibrant economy, fully utilizing our educational and cultural assets, so that every person has an opportunity to achieve financial security.

COUNCIL OPTIONS

This work session is informational only. Council feedback on ways that staff can incorporate triple bottom line information into materials for council and support deliberations is welcome.

CITY MANAGER'S RECOMMENDATION

The City Manager has no recommendation at this time.

SUGGESTED MOTIONS

No motion is necessary at this time.

ATTACHMENTS

- A. April 2010 Memo to Mayor and City Council: Update on Triple Bottom Line Framework
- B. TBL Template – Long Version

FOR MORE INFORMATION

Staff Contact: Keli Osborn, City Manager's Office Division Manager
Telephone: 541-682-5406
Staff E-Mail: keli.m.osborn@ci.eugene.or.us



City Manager's Office

City of Eugene
777 Pearl Street, Room 105
Eugene, Oregon 97401-2793
(541) 682-5010
(541) 682-5414 FAX
www.eugene-or.gov

MEMORANDUM

Date: April 8, 2010

To: Mayor Piercy and City Council

From: Kevin Finney, 541-682-5017
Interim Sustainability Manager

Subject: Update on Triple Bottom Line Framework

The triple bottom line concept balances multiple values and acknowledges that actions have social, environmental and economic impacts. The Sustainability Commission in 2008 recommended that the City of Eugene develop and implement a triple bottom line (TBL) tool for City Council policy decisions. The notion was that this tool could be used in preparing service profiles and to assess policy-level decisions made by the council, including new items proposed in the annual or supplemental budgets.

At the direction of City Manager Jon Ruiz, staff has created several TBL “screens,” including an online tool currently available for internal use. Staff included members of the Sustainability Commission, Human Rights Commission and Planning Commission in thinking about the framework and developing the tools. They remain keenly interested in continuing progress, and in assuring application of the TBL framework.

The tools have been applied in various ways – reviewing recommendations to date in the Walnut Station mixed-use project, evaluating potential FY11 budget reductions and fee increases for the Recreation Division, and conducting a back-end examination of Neighborhood Matching Grants. Beyond the tools themselves, staff is finding other ways to apply a triple bottom line framework to decisions.

The triple bottom line framework incorporates several elements:

Social Equity

How might a proposal or action affect the ability to meet basic human needs? How could it influence cultural expression, community relationships, effective government, safety and personal security needs, and neighborhood and stakeholder commitment and stewardship? Are there potential inequities for specific groups of people, and how are those addressed? Have all voices been heard?

Environmental Health

How could a proposal or action affect environmental health and our ability to effectively address climate uncertainties? Does it prevent pollution? What the possible impacts for air, soil and water? How might it affect how our community looks?

Economic Prosperity

How would an action or proposal affect the local economy and what are its costs to the community, now and over the long term? How does the proposal or action support responsible stewardship of public resources?

In developing his recommended budget for FY11, City Manager Jon Ruiz is asking these and similar questions to understand the potential impacts of various options and to develop a balanced budget approach that aligns with the Council Vision and Values, adopted in May 2009.

The Eugene City Council's vision is to:

Value all people, encouraging respect and appreciation for diversity, equity, justice, and social well-being. We recognize and appreciate our differences and embrace our common humanity as the source of our strength;

Be responsible stewards of our physical assets and natural resources. We will sustain our clean air and water, beautiful parks and open spaces, livable and safe neighborhoods, and foster a vibrant downtown, including a stable infrastructure; and

Encourage a strong, sustainable and vibrant economy, fully utilizing our educational and cultural assets, so that every person has an opportunity to achieve financial security.

Values: Safe Community; Sustainable Development; Accessible and Thriving Culture and Recreation; Effective, Accountable Municipal Government; and Fair, Stable and Adequate Financial Resources.

Incorporating the framework and tools into discussions and decision making within the organization will take several forms. The greatest value so far has come from the thinking and conversations inspired by application of the framework. Consequently, staff training emphasizes dialogue over isolated analysis – with recognition that a TBL tool is not a number-crunching device offering objective data and output. Applying the framework and employing specific tools is intended to focus energy on discovering what may have been unknown about the effects of a project, decision or service and thinking about ways to improve outcomes.

In the coming weeks and months, staff will provide summarized triple bottom line information to council in agenda item summaries and other materials. Upcoming examples include Neighborhood Matching Grants funding and the Community Climate and Energy Action Plan. With growing familiarity and expertise with the framework and particular tools, as well as feedback from council, TBL presentations should become more common over time.

Staff also is exploring ways to make the tools more accessible to other agencies and the public, and there is interest in evaluating proprietary options.

For more information, please explore a slide presentation and tools via links on the right-hand side of the City's Sustainability Commission web page: <http://www.eugene-or.gov/sustainabilitycommission>. Staff also is available to present information in a council meeting, at your request.

City of Eugene TRIPLE BOTTOM LINE ANALYSIS TOOL (TBL)



Creating a sustainable community

The City Vision:

- *Value all people, encouraging respect and appreciation for diversity, equity, justice, and social well-being. We recognize and appreciate our differences and embrace our common humanity as the source of our strength;*
- *Be responsible stewards of our physical assets and natural resources. We will sustain our clean air and water, beautiful parks and open space, livable and safe neighborhoods, and foster a vibrant downtown, including a stable infrastructure;*
- *Encourage a strong, sustainable and vibrant economy, fully utilizing our educational and cultural assets, so that every person has an opportunity to achieve financial security.*

How to use the tool

The TBL tool is designed to inform a deeper understanding of how policy and program choices will affect the social equity, environmental health and economic prosperity of the community. To facilitate a close and deliberate look at those effects, the tool should be used in the following circumstances:

- When formulating a recommendation to the City Council about a policy, program, proposal or initiative in an Agenda Item Summary (AIS). Use this tool to inform the development of the proposal and then summarize the analysis in the AIS.
- To aid in program reviews.
- To help guide service improvements.
- To evaluate the effects of significant budget changes.

The TBL tool does not dictate a particular course of action; rather, the analysis provides policy makers and staff with a greater awareness of some of the trade-offs, benefits and consequences associated with a proposal, leading to more mindful decision-making.

Brief description of proposal

Please provide a brief description of your proposal – 100 words or less

-

Staff lead(s):

Please note staff name, position/division and phone number

-

NOTE: Reference documents - The TBL Tool will include links to relevant City policies and plans.

Social Equity

Described as: Placing priority upon protecting, respecting, and fulfilling the full range of universal human rights, including civil, political, social, economic, and cultural rights. Providing adequate access to employment, food, housing, clothing, recreational opportunities, a safe and healthy environment and social services. Eliminating systemic barriers to equitable treatment and inclusion, and accommodating to differences among people. Emphasizing justice, impartiality, and equal opportunity for all.

Goal/outcome: It is our priority to support an equitable and adequate social system with access to employment, food, housing, clothing, education, recreational opportunities, a safe and healthy environment and social services, as well as to provide equal access to services and avoid negative impact for all people regardless of age, economic status, ability, immigration or citizenship status, race/ethnicity, gender, relationship status, religion, or sexual orientation. Equal opportunities for all people are sought. A community in which basic human rights is addressed, basic human needs are met, and all people have access to tools and resources to develop their capacity. This tool will help identify how the proposal affects community members and if there is a difference in how the decisions affect one or more social groups in the community. Areas of consideration in creating a vibrant socially equitable Eugene are: basic needs, inclusion, community safety, culture neighborhoods, and advancing social equity.

Analysis prompts

- *The prompts below are examples of the issues that need to be addressed. **They are not a check list.** Not all of the prompts and issues will be relevant for any one project. Issues not covered by these prompts may be very pertinent to a proposal- please include them in the analysis*
- *Is this proposal affected by any current policy, procedure or action plan? Has advice been sought from organizations that have a high level of expertise, or may be significantly affected by this proposal?*

Analysis/discussion

1. Meeting Basic Human Needs

- How does the proposal impact access to food, shelter, employment, health care, educational and recreational opportunities, a safe and healthy living environment or social services?
- Does this proposal affect the physical or mental health of individuals, or the status of public health in our community?
- How does this proposal contribute to helping people achieve and maintain an adequate standard of living, including housing, or food affordability, employment opportunities, healthy families, or other resiliency factors?

<p>2. Addressing Inequities and being Inclusive</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Are there any inequities to specific groups of people in this proposal, if so how will they be addressed? • Does this proposal meet the standards of the American's with Disabilities Act? • How does this proposal support the participation, growth and healthy development of our youth? Does it include Developmental Assets? • If the proposal affects a vulnerable section of our community (i.e. youth, persons with disabilities, etc.) has their voice been heard in this proposal? • Does this proposal take into account language or cultural barriers? • If public comment is sought during development or implementation of this proposal what steps will be taken to include a wide variety of people (including disabled, non-English speakers, illiterate, working, etc)? 	
<p>3. Insuring Community Safety</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How does this proposal address the specific safety and personal security needs of groups within the community, including women, people with disabilities, seniors, minorities, religious groups, children, immigrants, workers and others? • How does this proposal include crime prevention strategies, including environmental design? • Does this proposal affect civil rights? 	
<p>4. Culture</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Is this proposal culturally appropriate and how does this proposal affirm or deny the cultures of diverse communities? • How does this proposal create opportunities for artistic expression, cultural celebration or education of a cultural exchange? 	

<p>5. Addressing the Needs of Neighborhoods</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How does this proposal impact specific Eugene neighborhoods? • How are community members, stakeholders and interested parties provided with opportunities for meaningful participation in the decision making process of this proposal? • How does this proposal enhance neighborhoods and stakeholders' sense of commitment and stewardship to our community? 					
<p>6. Building Capacity to Advance Social Equity</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What plans have been made to communicate about and share the activities and impacts of this proposal within the City organization and/or the community? • How does this proposal strengthen collaboration and cooperation between the City organization and community members? 					
<p>Social Equity summary</p>					
<p>Overall, the effect of this proposal on social equity would be:</p>	<p>Negative</p>	<p>Somewhat Negative</p>	<p>Neutral</p>	<p>Somewhat Positive</p>	<p>Positive</p>

<p>Environmental Health</p> <p>Described as: Healthy, resilient ecosystems, clean air, water, and land. Decreased pollution and waste, low carbon emissions that contribute to climate change, lower fossil fuel use, decreased or no toxic product use. Prevents pollution, reduces use, promotes reuses, recycles natural resources.</p> <p>Goal/outcome: Protect, preserve, and restore the natural environment to ensure long-term maintenance of ecosystem functions necessary for support of future generations of all species. Reduce the adverse environmental impacts of all activities, continually review all activities to identify and implement strategies to prevent pollution; reduce energy consumption and increase energy efficiency; conserve water; reduce consumption and waste of natural resources; reuse, recycle and purchase recycled content products; reduce reliance on non-renewable resources.</p>	
<p>Analysis prompts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>The prompts below are examples of the issues that need to be addressed. They are not a check list. Not all of the prompts and issues will be relevant for any one project. Issues not covered by these prompts may be very pertinent to a proposal- please include them in the analysis</i> • <i>Is this proposal affected by any current policy, procedure or action plan? Has advice been sought from organizations that have a high level of expertise, or may be significantly affected by this proposal?</i> 	<p>Brief analysis/discussion</p>
<p>1. Environmental Impact</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does this proposal affect ecosystem functions or processes related to land, water, or air? • Will this proposal generate data or knowledge related to the use of resources? • Will this proposal promote or support education in prevention of pollution, and effective practices for reducing, reusing, and recycling of natural resources? • Does this proposal require or promote the continuous improvement of the environmental performance of the City organization or community? • Will this proposal affect the visual/landscape or aesthetic elements of the community? 	
<p>2. Climate change</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does this proposal directly generate or require the generation of greenhouse gases (such as through electricity consumption or transportation)? • How does this proposal align with the internal carbon 	

<p>neutral by 2020 goal adopted by the City Council?</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Will this proposal, or ongoing operations result in an increase or decrease in greenhouse gas emissions? • How does this proposal affect the community's efforts to reduce greenhouse gas emissions or otherwise mitigate adverse climate change activities? 	
<p>3. Protect, preserve, restore</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does this proposal result in the development or modification of land resources or ecosystem functions? • Does this proposal align itself with policies and procedures related to the preservation or restoration of natural habitat, greenways, protected wetlands, migratory pathways, or the urban growth boundary • How does this proposal serve to protect, preserve, or restore important ecological functions or processes? 	
<p>4. Pollution prevention</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does this proposal generate, or cause to be generated, waste products that can contaminate the environment? • Does this proposal require or promote pollution prevention through choice of materials, chemicals, operational practices and/or engineering controls? • Does this proposal require or promote prevention of pollution from toxic substances or other pollutants regulated by the state or federal government? • Will this proposal create significant amounts of waste or pollution? 	
<p>5. Rethink, replace, reduce, reuse, recirculate/recycle</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Does this proposal prioritize the rethinking of the materials or goods needed, reduction of resource or materials use, reuse of current natural resources or materials or energy products, or result in byproducts that are recyclable or can be re-circulated? 	

6. Emphasize local

- Does this proposal emphasize use of local materials, vendors, and or services to reduce resources and environmental impact of producing and transporting proposed goods and materials?
- Will the proposal cause adverse environmental effects somewhere other than the place where the action will take place?

Environmental Health summary

Overall, the effect of this proposal on environmental health would be:	Negative	Somewhat Negative	Neutral	Somewhat Positive	Positive
--	----------	-------------------	---------	-------------------	----------

<p>Economic prosperity Described as: Support of healthy local economy with new jobs, businesses, and economic opportunities; focus on development of a diverse economy, enhanced sustainable practices for existing businesses, green and clean technology jobs, creation or retention of family waged jobs.</p> <p>Goal/ outcome: A stable, diverse and equitable economy; support of business development opportunities.</p>	
<p>Analysis prompts</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • <i>The prompts below are examples of the issues that need to be addressed. They are not a check list. Not all of the prompts and issues will be relevant for any one project. Issues not covered by these prompts may be very pertinent to a proposal- please include them in the analysis</i> • <i>Is this proposal affected by any current policy, procedure or action plan? Has advice been sought from organizations that have a high level of expertise, or may be significantly affected by this proposal?</i> 	<p>Analysis/discussion</p>
<p>1. Infrastructure and government</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How will this proposal benefit the local economy? • If this proposal is an investment in infrastructure is it designed and will it be managed to optimize the use of resources including operating in a fossil fuel constrained society? • Can the proposal be funded partially or fully by grants, user fees or charges, staged development, or partnering with another agency? • How will the proposal impact business growth or operations (ability to complete desired project or remain in operation), such as access to needed permits, infrastructure and capital? 	
<p>2. Employment and training</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What are the impacts of this proposal on job creation within Lane County? • Are apprenticeships, volunteer or intern opportunities available? • How will this proposal enhance the skills of the local workforce? 	

<p>3. Diversified and innovative economy</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • How does this proposal support innovative or entrepreneurial activity? • Will “clean technology” or “green” jobs be created in this proposal? • How will the proposal impact start-up or existing businesses or development projects? 					
<p>4. Support or develop sustainable businesses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> • What percentage of this proposal budget is for local services or products? Identify for Lane County and State of Oregon. • Will this proposal enhance the tools available to businesses to incorporate more sustainable practices in operations and products? • Are there opportunities to profile sustainable and socially responsible leadership of local businesses or educate businesses on triple bottom line practices? 					
<p>5. Relevance to local economic development strategy</p>					
<p>Economic Prosperity summary</p>					
<p>Overall, the effect of this proposal on economic prosperity would be:</p>	<p>Negative</p>	<p>Somewhat Negative</p>	<p>Neutral</p>	<p>Somewhat Positive</p>	<p>Positive</p>

Proposal: triple bottom line analysis summary